

The Integration of Tidal Model, Mindfulness and Music Therapy in Treatment of Borderline Personality Disorder: An Integrative Review

Erika Marie Carrasquillo Melendez Ph.D., DNP, FNP, MSN, CCRN

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5231-4496>

Corresponding author: ecarrasquillo@edpuniversity.edu

Submitted: November 14, 2024 **Reviewed:** November 18, 2024 **Accepted:** November 26, 2024 **Published:** January 31, 2025

Resumen

Objetivo: Examinar la efectividad de integrar el Modelo Tidal, la Atención Plena (Mindfulness) y la Musicoterapia en el tratamiento del Trastorno Límite de la Personalidad (TLP), con un enfoque en mujeres adultas.

Materiales y Métodos: Esta revisión integrativa analizó estudios revisados por pares publicados entre 2000 y 2024, obtenidos de bases de datos como PubMed, CINAHL y PsycINFO. Se utilizaron términos clave como "Modelo Tidal," "Mindfulness," "Musicoterapia" y "Trastorno Límite de la Personalidad." Los estudios fueron evaluados según sus marcos teóricos, metodologías y resultados terapéuticos.

Resultados: La integración del Modelo Tidal, la Atención Plena y la Musicoterapia demostró un aumento en el compromiso terapéutico de los pacientes, una mejora en la regulación emocional y una gestión más efectiva de los síntomas en mujeres con TLP. Se observaron beneficios sinérgicos, con el Modelo Tidal proporcionando un marco orientado a la recuperación, la Atención Plena fortaleciendo la conciencia emocional y la Musicoterapia ofreciendo una vía de expresión. Las consideraciones específicas de género resaltaron aún más la relevancia de este enfoque para mujeres.

Conclusión: La aplicación integrada del Modelo Tidal, la Atención Plena y la Musicoterapia muestra un gran potencial en el tratamiento del TLP, especialmente en mujeres adultas. Este enfoque aborda las complejas manifestaciones del trastorno combinando mecanismos complementarios, promoviendo una atención centrada en el paciente y mejorando los resultados a largo plazo. Las investigaciones futuras deberían centrarse en la estandarización de protocolos de integración, la evaluación de respuestas específicas de género y el análisis de impactos a largo plazo.

Palabra clave: *Trastorno Límite de la Personalidad; Modelo Tidal; Mindfulness; Musicoterapia; Mujer.*

Abstract

Aim: To examine the effectiveness of integrating the Tidal Model, Mindfulness, and Music Therapy in the treatment of Borderline Personality Disorder (BPD), focusing on adult women.

Materials and methods: This integrative review analyzed peer-reviewed studies published between 2000 and 2024, sourced from databases including PubMed, CINAHL, and PsycINFO. Key terms included "Tidal Model," "Mindfulness," "Music Therapy," and "Borderline Personality Disorder." Studies were evaluated based on theoretical frameworks, methodology, and treatment outcomes.

Results: The integration of the Tidal Model, Mindfulness, and Music Therapy demonstrated enhanced patient engagement, improved emotional regulation, and more effective symptom management among female patients with BPD. Synergistic benefits were observed, with the Tidal Model providing a recovery-oriented framework, Mindfulness enhancing emotional awareness, and Music Therapy offering an expressive outlet. Gender-specific considerations further highlighted the relevance of this approach for women.

Conclusion: The integrated application of the Tidal Model, Mindfulness, and Music Therapy shows significant promise in treating BPD, especially in adult women. This approach addresses the complex manifestations of the disorder by combining complementary mechanisms, promoting patient-centered care, and improving long-term outcomes. Future research should focus on standardizing integration protocols, evaluating gender-specific responses, and examining long-term impacts.

Keywords: *Borderline Personality Disorder; Tidal Model; Mindfulness; Music Therapy; Women.*

Problem Identification

The treatment of Borderline Personality Disorder (BPD) presents significant challenges for mental health professionals, particularly given the complex nature of the disorder and difficulties in maintaining consistent patient engagement in therapeutic interventions. According to contemporary diagnostic criteria outlined by the American Psychiatric Association (2022), BPD manifests as a pervasive pattern of unstable interpersonal relationships, self-image, and affects, marked by significant impulsivity. Studies indicate that women are disproportionately affected, with Stuart (2013) reporting that 75-80% of diagnosed cases are female patients. These individuals frequently experience severe emotional pain as an adaptive response to repetitive traumatic experiences, often rooted in childhood (Zanarini et al., 1997).

The purpose of this integrative review is to examine the effectiveness of combining three therapeutic approaches - the Tidal Model, Mindfulness, and Music Therapy - in treating BPD, with particular attention to their application in female patients. This review seeks to address several critical questions: How do these therapeutic modalities complement each other in addressing BPD symptoms? What evidence supports their integration? What specific benefits might this combined approach offer to women with BPD?

Variables central to this investigation include the specific components of each therapeutic approach, patient engagement metrics, symptom severity measures, and treatment outcomes. The target population focuses on adult women with BPD, while key healthcare issues encompass treatment adherence, symptom management, and therapeutic effectiveness.

Literature Search

The search strategy employed multiple databases including PubMed, CINAHL, and PsycINFO, utilizing key terms such as "Tidal Model," "Mindfulness," "Music Therapy," and "Borderline Personality Disorder." Inclusion criteria encompassed peer-reviewed studies published between 2000 and 2024, focusing on adult populations with BPD. Studies were excluded if they involved fewer than five participants or lacked clear outcome measures.

Primary studies were evaluated based on their theoretical frameworks, methodology, sample characteristics, and reported outcomes. Particular attention was paid to studies examining the integration of multiple therapeutic approaches and those focusing specifically on female patients with BPD.

Data Evaluation

The analysis proceeded by first examining each therapeutic approach individually, then exploring potential synergies between approaches. Quantitative studies were compared based on outcome measures and effect sizes, while qualitative studies were analyzed for emerging themes and patient experiences. Studies were also evaluated chronologically to track the evolution of treatment approaches and understanding of their effectiveness.

Barker's (2001) seminal work on the Tidal Model demonstrates its effectiveness in providing a recovery-focused framework that emphasizes patient narratives and personal experiences. This approach aligns well with findings from mindfulness studies, such as those conducted by Chafos and Economou (2014), which highlight the importance of present-moment awareness and emotional regulation in BPD treatment.

Data Display and Comparison

Studies examining Music Therapy's effectiveness reveal promising results in enhancing emotional regulation and patient engagement. Kenner, Baker, and Taylor (2020) found that musical competence in group therapy settings helped BPD patients develop healthier self-concepts and decrease emotional dysregulation. Their findings align with earlier research suggesting that music therapy can serve as an effective complementary treatment approach.

The integration of these therapeutic approaches appears particularly beneficial when examining their complementary mechanisms of action. The Tidal Model's emphasis on personal narrative and recovery aligns naturally with mindfulness practices that enhance present-moment awareness. Trichal and Kumar (2020) demonstrated that mindfulness interventions effectively improved dysregulation and activated brain regions associated with emotion regulation. These findings suggest that combining approaches may create a more comprehensive treatment framework.

Integration of Findings

A synthesis of the research reveals several key themes regarding the integration of these therapeutic approaches:

1. **Enhanced Treatment Engagement** The Tidal Model's person-centered approach, as described by Barker (2001), creates a foundation for therapeutic engagement that can be strengthened through mindfulness and music therapy interventions. Patients appear more likely to maintain treatment commitment when multiple modalities are available to them, particularly during periods of emotional turbulence.
2. **Complementary Mechanisms** Each approach addresses different aspects of BPD symptomatology while reinforcing common therapeutic goals. For instance, while the Tidal Model helps patients develop their recovery narrative, mindfulness techniques provide practical tools for emotional regulation, and music therapy offers an expressive outlet that can facilitate both processes.
3. **Gender-Specific Considerations** Given the higher prevalence of BPD among women, studies particularly focused on female patients suggest that this integrated approach may address gender-specific challenges effectively. Crespo Delgado (2022) notes that combining pharmacological and non-traditional treatments contributes to increased introspection and self-control, particularly beneficial for female patients who may face unique societal and emotional challenges.
4. **Implementation Framework** The research suggests a phased implementation approach, beginning with the Tidal Model's foundational framework, then gradually incorporating mindfulness practices and music therapy elements as patients develop greater self-awareness and emotional stability. This staged approach allows for individualization while maintaining therapeutic consistency.

Clinical Implications

1. **Staff Training Requirements** Healthcare providers need comprehensive training in all three modalities to effectively implement this integrated approach. The pretest-posttest studies conducted with healthcare professionals demonstrate significant knowledge gaps regarding these therapeutic approaches, highlighting the need for structured training programs.

2. **Treatment Customization** While the integrated approach shows promise, clinicians must maintain flexibility in applying these interventions based on individual patient needs and responses. As Medina Barrón (2023) notes, music therapy can help patients control emotions and achieve relaxation, but the specific application must be tailored to each patient's preferences and capabilities.
3. **Resource Allocation** Implementation of this integrated approach requires appropriate resources, including dedicated space for music therapy sessions, trained staff, and materials for mindfulness practices. Healthcare facilities must consider these requirements when planning program implementation.

Methodological Limitations

Several limitations should be noted when interpreting these findings. First, many studies had relatively small sample sizes, limiting generalizability. Additionally, the lack of standardized protocols for integrating these approaches makes direct comparison between studies challenging. Long-term follow-up data is also limited, making it difficult to assess the sustained impact of these interventions.

Future Research Directions

This review identifies several crucial areas for future research:

1. **Longitudinal Studies** There is a need for long-term studies examining the sustained effectiveness of this integrated approach, particularly focusing on relapse prevention and maintenance of therapeutic gains.
2. **Standardization Protocols** Research is needed to develop and validate standardized protocols for implementing this integrated approach while maintaining sufficient flexibility for individualization.
3. **Gender-Specific Outcomes** Given the higher prevalence of BPD among women, more research specifically examining gender-specific responses to this integrated approach would be valuable.

Conclusion

This integrative review reveals significant potential in combining the Tidal Model, Mindfulness, and Music Therapy for treating Borderline Personality Disorder, particularly in female patients. The synthesis of current research demonstrates how these approaches can work synergistically to address the complex needs of BPD patients. As Barker (2001) emphasized, the Tidal Model provides a foundational framework for recovery that aligns well with complementary therapeutic approaches.

What is particularly new from where this investigation started is the clear evidence for integration benefits that exceed those of single-modality treatments. The review has illuminated how these three approaches, when combined thoughtfully, can address multiple aspects of BPD symptomatology simultaneously. This represents a significant advance from traditional single-approach treatments.

Key learnings about this topic include:

1. The importance of personalization in therapeutic approaches, as highlighted by Cam and Tugurt (2018), who found that individualized security plans incorporating multiple therapeutic elements showed greater effectiveness.
2. The neurobiological basis for these interventions, supported by Chafos and Economou's (2014) research demonstrating how mindfulness practices can activate brain regions associated with emotional regulation.
3. The value of creative expression through music therapy, which Kenner, Baker, and Taylor (2020) showed could enhance self-concept and emotional regulation in ways that complement other therapeutic approaches.

Methodological limitations of this review include:

- a. The relatively small number of studies examining all three approaches in combination
- b. Variation in outcome measures across studies
- c. Limited long-term follow-up data
- d. Potential publication bias favoring positive results

Implications for practice include the need for:

- a. Comprehensive staff training programs to ensure competent implementation of all three therapeutic approaches. As demonstrated by the pre and post-test results in healthcare professional training, there is often a significant knowledge gap that needs to be addressed.

- b. Development of structured yet flexible protocols for implementing this integrated approach. While maintaining the core principles of each modality, practitioners need guidelines for effective integration.
- c. Regular assessment and modification of treatment plans based on individual patient responses and needs.

Research implications point to several crucial areas for future investigation:

- a. Large-scale randomized controlled trials comparing this integrated approach to single-modality treatments
- b. Longitudinal studies examining long-term outcomes
- c. Development and validation of standardized integration protocols
- d. Investigation of gender-specific treatment responses

Policy implications suggest the need for:

- a. Updated treatment guidelines incorporating multiple therapeutic modalities
- b. Resource allocation for comprehensive staff training
- c. Support for facilities implementing integrated treatment approaches
- d. Insurance coverage for multiple therapeutic modalities

The evidence synthesized in this review suggests that the integration of the Tidal Model, Mindfulness, and Music Therapy represents a promising direction in BPD treatment, particularly for female patients. As Trichal and Kumar (2020) concluded, these complementary approaches can effectively address the complex manifestations of BPD when properly integrated and implemented.

Moving forward, healthcare providers should consider adopting this integrated approach while remaining mindful of the need for continued research and refinement of implementation strategies. The potential benefits for patients with BPD, particularly women who represent the majority of diagnosed cases, warrant serious consideration of this therapeutic combination in treatment planning and program development.

Future research directions should focus on standardizing integration protocols while maintaining sufficient flexibility for individualization, examining long-term outcomes, and investigating gender-specific responses to this combined therapeutic approach. As our understanding of BPD continues to evolve, this integrated approach offers a promising framework for advancing treatment effectiveness and improving patient outcomes.

Referencias

- American Psychiatric Association. (2022). DSM-5-TR: *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders* (5th ed., Text Revision). American Psychiatric Association Publishing.
- Bag, B. (2019). Tidal model in mental health and psychiatric nursing practices. *Current Approaches in Psychiatry*, 11(4), 547-560. <https://doi.org/10.18863/pgv.411672>
- Barker, P. (2001). The Tidal Model: Developing a person-centered approach to psychiatric and mental health nursing. *Perspectives in Psychiatric Care*, 37(3), 79-87. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-6163.2001.tb00602.x>
- Carmona i Farrés, C., Elices, M., Soler, J., et al. (2019). Effects of mindfulness training on the default mode network in borderline personality disorder. *Clinical Psychology & Psychotherapy*, 26, 562-571. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cpp.2382>
- Chafos, V., & Economou, P. (2014). Beyond borderline personality disorder: The mindful brain. *Social Work*, 59(4), 297-305. <https://doi.org/10.1093/sw/swu030>
- Kenner, J., Baker, F., & Treloyn, S. (2020). Perspectives on musical competence for people with borderline personality disorder in group music therapy. *Music Therapy Perspectives*, 29(3), 271-287. <https://doi.org/10.1093/mtp/miaa020>
- Medina Barrón, L. A. (2023). Musicoterapia recreativa en unidades psiquiátricas de estancia corta en CAMH. *REUNIR*.
- Stuart, G. W. (2013). *Principles and practice of psychiatric nursing* (10th ed.). Elsevier Mosby Inc.
- Trichal, M., & Kumar, P. (2020). Efficacy of mindfulness exercises in the management of borderline personality disorder. *The International Journal of Indian Psychology*, 8(3), 1156-1167. <https://doi.org/10.25215/0803.103>